

EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL

SOUTHERN LOCAL PLANNING COMMITTEE: 12 APRIL 2002

**01/0538/FL: PROPOSED ERECTION OF DWELLINGHOUSE
AT 10 FORD STREET, CATRINE**

APPLICATION BY MR GEORGE GLOVER

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY SHEET

1. DEVELOPMENT DESCRIPTION

1.1 Full planning permission is sought for the erection of a single storey, 3-bedroom dwellinghouse on the site. The applicant proposes to retain and repair the boundary wall to the front of the site. The proposed dwellinghouse is situated such that the gable end fronts onto Ford Street. The applicant proposes to externally finish the dwellinghouse with interlocking concrete roofing tiles, red pine fascias and soffits and pink dry dash render. The applicant proposes the use of reconstituted red sandstone for the cills, lintels and base course of the proposed dwellinghouse.

2. RECOMMENDATION

2.1 It is recommended that the application be refused for the reasons listed on the attached sheet.

3. CONCLUSIONS

3.1 As is indicated at paragraph 5.2 of the report, the application is considered to be contrary to the development plan. Therefore, given the terms of Sections 25 and 37(2) of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997, the application should be refused unless material considerations indicate otherwise. As indicated in Section 6 of the report, there are other material considerations but these add weight to the view that the proposal is unacceptable as the proposal is contrary to Policies RES4, ENV4 and ENV7 of the East Ayrshire Local Plan (Finalised Version with Modifications).

3.2 The proposal also requires to be determined with regard to East Ayrshire Council's Design Guidance for listed Buildings and Buildings within Conservation Areas. As is noted in the report, the proposal is contrary to the provisions set out in the Design Guidance. While the principle of residential development of this gap site is acceptable, the design and layout of the proposed development is inappropriate for this site within Catrine Conservation Area.

CONTRARY DECISION NOTE

Should the Committee agree to grant the application contrary to the recommendation of the Head of Planning and Building Control, the application would not require to be referred to the Development Services Committee as it would not represent a significant departure from the provisions of the East Ayrshire Local Plan (Finalised Version with Modifications).

Alan Neish
Head of Planning and Building Control

Note: This document combines key sections of the associated report for quick reference and should not in itself be considered as having been the basis for recommendation preparation or decision making by the Planning Authority.

EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL

SOUTHERN LOCAL PLANNING COMMITTEE: 12 APRIL 2002

**01/0538/FL: PROPOSED ERECTION OF DWELLINGHOUSE
AT 10 FORD STREET, CATRINE**

APPLICATION BY MR GEORGE GLOVER

Report by Head of Planning and Building Control

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 The purpose of this report is to present for determination a full planning application which is to be considered by the Local Planning Committee under the Scheme of Delegation as the application is contrary to policy and is recommended for refusal.

2. APPLICATION DETAILS

2.1 **Site Description:** The application site comprises a previously developed gap site on the west side of Ford Street and measures 400 square metres in area. The site lies within the Catrine Conservation Area and within Catrine Town Centre. It is in an overgrown state and is separated from the footway on Ford Street by a partially roughcast common brick wall approximately 1.8metres in height. A two-storey red sandstone building stands adjacent to the site to the north, whilst a terrace of single storey dwellings lie adjacent to the south of the site

2.2 **Proposed Development:** Full planning permission is sought for the erection of a single storey, 3-bedroom dwellinghouse on the site. The applicant proposes to retain and repair the boundary wall to the front of the site. The proposed dwellinghouse is situated such that the gable end fronts onto Ford Street. The applicant proposes to externally finish the dwellinghouse with interlocking concrete roofing tiles, red pine fascias and soffits and pink dry dash render. The applicant proposes the use of reconstituted red sandstone for the cills, lintels and base course of the proposed dwellinghouse.

3. CONSULTATIONS AND ISSUES RAISED

3.1 East Ayrshire Council's Roads and Transportation Division has no objection to the proposal subject to conditions in respect of the formation and standard of the access to the site, the relocation of the street lighting column and electrical control pillar adjacent to the proposed access, the provision of car parking spaces and the location of any proposed garage.

Should the application be approved, appropriate conditions in respect of the above can be included on the planning permission.

3.2 West of Scotland Water Authority has no objection to the proposal provided its operational requirements can be satisfied.

Should the application be approved, an appropriate note in respect of the above can be attached to the planning permission.

3.3 Scottish Power has no objection to the proposal, provided its apparatus is safeguarded during construction of the proposed dwellinghouse.

Should the application be approved, an appropriate note in respect of the above can be attached to the planning permission.

3.4 The Coal Authority has no objection to the proposal.

Noted.

3.5 Catrine Community Council has not responded to the consultation letter.

Noted.

3.6 The Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland, whilst not objecting to the proposal, advises that the detached suburban nature of the design of the kit house makes it unsympathetic with the streetscape and character of the Conservation Area. The Society further advises that the proposals could be improved if the planter located on the front elevation of the dwelling and the bay window were removed and if the rendered wall was replaced with a sandstone wall. The Society adds that, in order to maintain the historic tradition, the new house would have to adjoin the property at No. 8 and should be L-shaped.

The applicant has been advised of the Council's Design Guidance (discussed below) and that this kit house of a suburban character would not be appropriate in the Conservation Area. The applicant was further advised that a detached dwelling may have been acceptable should it be positioned such that its ridge line ran parallel to Ford Street. The applicant was unwilling to consider this as an amendment and agreed to the use of reconstituted sandstone, pink render and window banding to make the proposal more acceptable. Amended plans showing this were subsequently submitted. However, following a full assessment of the amended plans, it is considered that the proposal still does not integrate sympathetically with the streetscape and is rather suburban in character. It would therefore be detrimental to the character and appearance of Catrine Conservation Area.

4. REPRESENTATIONS

4.1 None.

5. ASSESSMENT AGAINST THE DEVELOPMENT PLAN

5.1 Sections 25 and 37(2) of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 require that planning applications be determined in accordance with the development plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise. For the purposes of this application, the development plan comprises the Approved Ayrshire Joint Structure Plan (1999) and the Adopted Catrine and Sorn Local Plan (1984). The Adopted Plan was prepared in the context of the then emerging Strathclyde Structure Plan.

5.2 Notwithstanding the age of the Adopted Local Plan, the application requires to be determined with regard to Policy 4.9.4A sub-sections (c), (d) and (e). This policy states:-

- (c) *New development that will adversely affect the character of an area will not be allowed;*

It is considered that the proposed dwellinghouse, which has a gable wall fronting Ford Street and which is essentially suburban in appearance would have an adverse impact on the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

- (d) *New buildings must be erected on similar building lines to those existing;*

The proposed dwelling would not be built on a similar building line to that existing, although the building line could be continued with the use of the 1.8metre high boundary wall.

- (e) *The scale, materials and design of new buildings should harmonise as far as possible with the existing development;*

Notwithstanding the proposed use of reconstituted red sandstone, render and banding, the proposed form of the dwelling, incorporating a gable wall fronting Ford street is not considered to harmonise with the existing streetscape.

It is therefore considered that the proposal is contrary to the provisions of Policy 4.9.4A of the Adopted Catrine and Sorn Local Plan.

6. ASSESSMENT AGAINST OTHER MATERIAL CONSIDERATIONS

6.1 The other principal considerations relevant to the determination of the application are the East Ayrshire Local Plan (Finalised Version with modifications) (2001), the consultation replies, the Council's Design Guidance and the objections detailed above.

6.2 The Adopted Local Plan is considerably out of date and therefore it is considered appropriate that greater weight should be attached to more recent expressions of policy. The Council has agreed that the East Ayrshire Local Plan, Finalised Version with Modifications (EALP) should be considered as a prime material consideration.

East Ayrshire Local Plan

6.3 The proposal requires to be determined against Policy RES 4 of the EALP which encourages the redevelopment of gap sites provided the proposal complies with the Council's Design Guidance.

Whilst the proposal represents an opportunity to re-use an existing gap site, it nevertheless is not considered to comply with the Council's Design Guidance which is discussed below. It is therefore contrary to Policy RES4.

6.4 The application also falls to be determined with regard to Policy ENV4 of the EALP which states:

The Council will seek to ensure that all development within or affecting the setting of a Conservation Area or affecting the appearance or setting of a Listed Building, is sympathetic to the area or building concerned in terms of its layout, size, scale, design, siting, materials and colour of finish. Wherever possible, all proposals should seek to preserve, enhance or incorporate features, which contribute positively to the character or appearance of the area and have due regard to the architectural and historic qualities of the area or building concerned.

It is considered that the proposed dwellinghouse is not sympathetic to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area as it is suburban in character and is positioned such that its gable wall fronts Ford Street. The proposal is therefore considered to be contrary to the provisions of Policy ENV4.

6.5 Policy ENV7 of the EALP is of relevance and states that:-

All developers will be expected to comply fully with the Council's existing and emerging Design Guidance and Policy Documents relating to and advising on the particular type of development proposed. Developments which do not meet the required design standards detailed in these documents will require to be fully justified and may not be supported by the Council.

The Design Guidance is discussed in paragraph 6.6 of the report. The proposal is considered to be contrary to the provisions of the Design Guidance and as such, would be contrary to the provisions of Policy ENV7.

Design Guidance

6.6 The East Ayrshire Council Design Guidance for Listed Buildings and Buildings within Conservation Areas is of relevance in the determination of the application. Section 2 of the Guidance states:

Where a new build development is proposed within a Conservation Area, the proposed building will require the character of adjoining buildings in terms of building line, height, massing, scale, choice of materials, colour, fenestration and solid/void proportions. When determining an appropriate building height for any new proposals, the height of surrounding buildings and the impact of the proposal on the skyline must be taken into account. All materials used should be of a sympathetic and suitable colour and finish.

The proposed dwellinghouse does not reflect the character of adjoining buildings as it is positioned such that it has a gable wall fronting onto Ford Street. Furthermore, notwithstanding the retention of the existing wall, the proposed dwelling does not reflect the existing building line. The solid/void proportion and details are also inappropriate for the Conservation Area, giving the proposed house a distinct suburban character. It is therefore considered that the proposal is contrary to the provisions of the Design Guidance.

Consultation Replies

6.7 Other than the reply from the Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland, no adverse consultation replies have been received.

Noted.

7. FINANCIAL AND LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

7.1 There are no financial or legal implications for the Council in the determination of this application.

8. CONCLUSIONS

8.1 As is indicated at paragraph 5.2 of the report, the application is considered to be contrary to the development plan. Therefore, given the terms of Sections 25 and 37(2) of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997, the application should be refused unless material considerations indicate otherwise. As indicated in Section 6 of the report, there are other material considerations but these add weight to the view that the proposal is unacceptable as the proposal is contrary to Policies RES4, ENV4 and ENV7 of the East Ayrshire Local Plan (Finalised Version with Modifications).

8.2 The proposal also requires to be determined with regard to East Ayrshire Council's Design Guidance for listed Buildings and Buildings within Conservation Areas. As is noted in the report, the proposal is contrary to the

provisions set out in the Design Guidance. While the principle of residential development of this gap site is acceptable, the design and layout of the proposed development is inappropriate for this site within Catrine Conservation Area.

9. RECOMMENDATION

9.1 It is recommended that the application be refused for the reasons listed on the attached sheet.

CONTRARY DECISION NOTE

Should the Committee agree to grant the application contrary to the recommendation of the Head of Planning and Building Control, the application would not require to be referred to the Development Services Committee as it would not represent a significant departure from the provisions of the East Ayrshire Local Plan (Finalised Version with Modifications).

Alan Neish
Head of Planning and Building Control
19 March 2002
DS/SMB
FV/DVM

LIST OF BACKGROUND PAPERS

1. Application form and plans
2. Statutory notices and certificates
3. Consultation replies
4. East Ayrshire Local Plan (Finalised Version with Modifications)
5. Approved Ayrshire Joint Structure Plan
6. Adopted Catrine and Sorn Local Plan
7. East Ayrshire Council Design Guidance
8. Approved Strathclyde Structure Plan.

Any person wishing to inspect the background papers listed above, should contact Mr Derek Scott on 01563 555483.

Implementation Officer: Dave Morris

Location	10 Ford Street CATRINE KA5 6RW
Nature of Proposal:	Proposed erection of single dwellinghouse
Name and Address of Applicant:	Mr George Glover "Knowe" Auchinleck Road CUMNOCK KA18 1AE
Name and Address of Agent	

DPO's Ref: [Derek Scott]
PPO's Ref; []

The above FULL application should be refused for the following reasons:-

1. The proposal is contrary to Policy 4.9.4A of the Adopted Catrine and Sorn Local Plan as it would adversely affect the character of the Catrine Conservation Area; the proposed site layout does not reflect the existing building line; and the design of the proposed dwellinghouse does not harmonise with the existing streetscape of Ford Street.
2. The proposal is contrary to Policy RES4 of the East Ayrshire Local Plan (Finalised Version with Modifications) in that, while the policy is supportive of the development of a gap site, it is considered that the proposed development, in terms of its design, style and site layout fails to accord with the Council's Design Guidance.
3. The proposal is contrary to Policy ENV4 of the East Ayrshire Local Plan (Finalised Version with Modifications) as the dwelling is predominantly suburban in character and is positioned such that the gable wall fronts onto Ford Street. The proposal is not therefore complimentary to the visual amenity, character and appearance of Catrine Conservation Area.
4. The proposal is contrary to Policy ENV7 of the East Ayrshire Local Plan (Finalised Version with Modifications) as it fails to comply with the provisions of the East Ayrshire Council Design Guidance for Listed Buildings and Buildings in Conservation Areas. The proposal is not in accordance with Section 2 of the Council's Design Guidance for Listed Buildings and Buildings within Conservation Areas, as it does not reflect the character of adjoining buildings in terms of its building line, fenestration, solid/void proportion and the proposed design and materials do not reflect the character and quality of the existing buildings within Catrine Conservation Area.

**DUE TO ORDNANCE SURVEY REGULATIONS AND COPYRIGHT
THE MAP IS AVAILABLE FOR VIEWING AT THE COUNCIL'S**

**PLANNING OFFICE IN LUGAR. FOR INFORMATION ON
VIEWING PLEASE CONTACT (01563) 555320.**

AGENDA